Final Report:
Providing Services to Trafficking Victims: Understanding Practices Across the Globe

Report Prepared for:
Safe Horizon

Project Conducted By:
Center on Violence Against Women and Children
Rutgers University School of Social Work

Dr. Judy L. Postmus, Director

Report Prepared By:
Jamie Kynn, MA, MSW
Jordan Steiner, MA
Gretchen L. Hoge, PhD, MSW
Judy L. Postmus, Ph.D., ACSW

August 2016

Overview of Project

Safe Horizon, a victim assistance agency serving the New York City area, is developing and convening a Global Learning Collaborative of human trafficking providers in order to explore best practice approaches when working with victims of human trafficking. As a first step before convening such a group, it was crucial to hear the voices of service providers around the world and to document those voices in a summary of findings. This summary will serve as a foundation for Safe Horizon to then gather service providers for the Global Learning Collaborative.

Through funding by Philip Morris International (PMI), Safe Horizon contracted the Center on Violence Against Women & Children (VAWC) at Rutgers University's School of Social Work to interview providers working with victims of human trafficking across the globe. Safe Horizon chose to work with VAWC to engage an international network of human trafficking service providers in order to explore practice approaches for this project, Providing Services to Trafficking Victims: Understanding Practices Across the Globe.

This research was completed in two concurrent project phases. The goal of Phase One was to complete a comprehensive literature review on best practices and policies related to services for human trafficking victims across the globe. Publications and research studies found in the academic literature as well as online reports were reviewed by the research team. This information was used to inform the data methods used in Phase Two and to provide background information for Safe Horizon in preparation for the Global Learning Collaborative.

The goal of Phase Two was to collect detailed information from at least thirty providers from twenty countries to learn about and summarize their practice approaches when working with human trafficking victims. This was accomplished by: 1) Identifying the 30 providers from at least 20 countries to participate in interviews for the project; 2) Interviewing the identified providers about their work with human trafficking victims; and 3) Analyzing the data collected.

This report summarizes findings from this project and includes a literature review, as well as study methods and results from the interviews. The report concludes with a series of recommendations based on these findings.

Literature Review

Overview of the Issue

Human trafficking impacts every country in the world with victims representing all genders, age groups, and global regions. Trafficking in persons is estimated to generate about 30 billion dollars each year, making it one of the fastest growing illegal industries (Hernandez & Rudolph, 2015). Despite its far reaching effect and growing profitability, human trafficking only came to the forefront fifteen years ago when the United Nations (UN) General Assembly adopted the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, also referred to as the Palermo Protocol. The Palermo Protocol created the first internationally accepted definition of human trafficking:

> "…the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation." (UN General Assembly, 2000, p. 2).

There is a wealth of general information available on human trafficking and existing international, regional and national anti-human trafficking policies. However, very little is known about how to best support victims of human trafficking, and not enough research exists to identify evidence-based practices (Weitzer, 2014; Gozdziak & Collett 2005; Zhang 2012). The bulk of existing research is Western-Centric and focuses primarily on the United States (Desyllas, 2007; Hodge, 2014). There is also a heavy emphasis on child sex trafficking (Alvarez & Alessi, 2012; Weitzer, 2014; Chuang, 2010). This project focused on human trafficking for the purposes of labor and commercial sex in adult populations and attempted to synthesize the limited research that exists in this area.

The Palermo Protocol uses what is called the "3P Framework" in an attempt to create a comprehensive anti-trafficking policy model. The 3 P's are: protection (of human trafficking victims); prevention (of future human trafficking); and prosecution (of traffickers). The United States federal anti-trafficking law is modeled after the Palermo Protocol, and the U.S. Department of State considers the 3P Framework to be a significant criterion in evaluating governments' efforts to combat trafficking in the annual Trafficking in Persons Report (U.S. Dept. of State, 2015). The 3P Framework is used as a uniform model across the globe and will thereby be used in this report to organize and analyze the existing literature and define gaps where research is lacking in the areas of protection, prevention and prosecution as they relate to human trafficking.

Protection

Protection refers to the varying policies and practices that exist to ensure that human trafficking victims are treated compassionately and receive trauma-informed and culturally relevant services. While the Palermo Protocol strives to create a comprehensive trafficking model, countries that have ratified the protocol are not legally mandated to provide services for victims of human trafficking (Farrell et al., 2014). This policy gap creates a void in the research that identifies victims' needs created by being trafficked because services are not required to be offered to victims and evaluations of these services are not mandated.

Within existing research, there is an emphasis on trauma-focused care for human trafficking victims. Trauma-focused care is unique in that it acknowledges the vulnerability of victims and the nuanced nature of the crime itself (Davies, 2007**)**. Using this type of care, practitioners should be non-judgmental during an intervention, which starts with avoiding assumptions about how individuals entered into their trafficking experience (Rand, 2015). Practitioners should also encourage victims to make choices at every possible opportunity as well as exhibit patience, and empathy while interacting with victims in order to avoid re-traumatization (President's I.T.F.T., 2015; Heffernan & Blythe, 2014). Additionally, practitioners should demonstrate cultural sensitivity in terms of language and customs since victims may have been trafficked across

national borders (Caliber, 2003). Service providers should be aware that most models of helping are based on Western modes of talk therapy and services; hence, practitioners must be more flexible and open to victims' individual needs and their cultural orientations (Caliber, 2007; Baker & Grover, 2013). Misunderstandings can often result in exacerbating the victims' sense of isolation and can potentially re-victimize them (Williamson et al., 2010).

When assessing clients, practitioners should use trauma-informed practice techniques, ensuring that their clients' mental state is considered when determining treatment. Human trafficking victims often experience multiple types of abuse that have a range of consequences related to mental health. These consequences may include anxiety, depression, and/or Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) (Williamson et al., 2010). These disorders require trauma-informed interventions and treatment plans that involve sustained mental health services and collaboration with medical providers if pharmacotherapy is needed. Substance abuse is also prevalent within the population, and may start while being trafficked; many victims report that they were forced or coerced to use drugs or alcohol by traffickers, and a small group reported that they used drugs or alcohol as a means of coping with their experience (Williamson et al., 2010).

Practitioners should keep the needs of human trafficking victims in mind while providing services since those needs may change over time. For example, human trafficking victims' immediate needs may include emergency shelter. Short term needs often include accessing medical and dental services, reconnecting with their families, and accepting mental health treatment. Long-term needs may include assistance with housing, job and life skills training, continued safety and protection, and legal and immigration assistance (Busch-Armendariz et al., 2011). Victims may prioritize different needs, for example, medical needs and getting in touch with their families may be more important than receiving mental health services (Caliber, 2007).

Research demonstrates that services for victims of human trafficking are often inadequate and inconsistent at the initial involvement, as well as when care becomes more long-term (Caliber, 2003; Hodge, 2014). Such problems may result from requiring victims to participate in criminal proceedings in order to access benefits for services (Caliber, 2007). Human trafficking victims may be hesitant to comply with the criminal justice system for a range of reasons, including fear of being arrested or deported, concerns for their personal safety or the safety of their family, distrust of authority figures, or fear of being implicated for crimes that they were involved in during their trafficking experience (Caliber 2007; Farrell & Pheffer, 2014).

Indicators that an individual may be a victim of human trafficking are classified into three categories: <u>situational</u>, <u>story</u>, and <u>demeanor</u>.

-**Situational indicators:** absence of documentation, constant presence of another individual (e.g. trafficker), signs of physical abuse, HIV/AIDS, damage to vagina/anus, large number of people living together in a private residence, frequent changes of address or physical location

-**Story indicators:** Indications that the individual is being controlled, does not have the freedom to move or change employment, force to provide sex

-**Demeanor indicators:** fear, depression, tendency to answer questions evasively, tendency to change details of their story (Hodge, 2014)

Many trafficking victims are uninformed about the options that they have as victims of human trafficking under the law (Caliber 2007; Farrell & Pfeffer, 2014). Non-compliance with legal systems may have negative consequences, like being deprived of access to government-based benefits, compensation and visas. As they weigh their needs and options, they are often making trade-offs in one area of safety in order to increase safety or meet needs in another area of their life. Agencies and advocates need to understand the many factors that victims may be considering in their decision making, and organizations must also ensure that their services align with victims' needs. Additionally, service providers must communicate with their client base to ensure that clients do understand the options afforded to them. It is important to note, however, that many organizations may offer short and long-term services and support to human trafficking victims without requiring participation in criminal proceedings.

Another challenge in the area of protection includes the lack of evidence-based models exclusively designed to assist victims of human trafficking. Because of this, agencies often rely on services created for victims of other types of violence such as domestic violence. However, human trafficking victims' needs may differ from those of domestic or interpersonal violence (Freedom Network USA, 2012). For example, human trafficking victims may need extended housing assistance beyond what domestic violence or homeless shelters allow (Baker & Grover, 2013). Additionally, workers who are employed to help victims of human trafficking need extensive training to understand the nuances of the complex trauma that trafficking victims experience (Davies, 2007).

Prevention

Though the Palermo Protocol emphasizes prevention of human trafficking, the specific means of how to prevent it from occurring are not spelled out. Because legal definitions and cultural attitudes about what qualifies as human trafficking vary, countries' strategies for prevention differ (Kangaspunta, 2003). There are three main human trafficking prevention models found in the literature (Bruch, 2004). The first model concentrates on prevention through law enforcement, criminalizing trafficking in an attempt to stop future incidences. Another common model frames prevention as enforcing migrants' rights, which includes protecting individuals from various types of labor exploitation. The third model focuses on basic human rights by framing trafficking as a violation of such rights.

Law Enforcement-Focused Prevention Models

Countries that use a law enforcement model consider trafficking to be an issue of national and international security (Farrell & Fahy, 2009; Sharapov, 2015). They tend to focus their prevention efforts on securing borders through severe national security measures (Feingold, 2005). In this model, law enforcement agencies decide which victims will have access to benefits and services, primarily by linking these services to victim participation in the criminal investigation of their trafficker (Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women, 2007). Unfortunately, law enforcement officers often lack training and knowledge about human trafficking. Such law enforcement-based policies may negatively impact human trafficking victims by failing to appropriately identify human trafficking victims or by re-victimizing those they do identify.

Migrants' Rights-Focused Prevention Models

For those countries or organizations that use the second model - emphasizing migrants' rights - their prevention efforts focus on labor trafficking (Bruch, 2004). The focus that the migrants' rights perspective places on labor trafficking pulls attention away from human trafficking experiences that may include multiple types of trafficking (Sharapov, 2015). Additionally, this perspective emphasizes the need for movement across national borders for an experience to be considered human trafficking and thus excludes stories about citizens who have been trafficked within their own communities.

Human Rights-Focused Prevention Models

Prevention policies using the human rights perspective, the third model identified, tend to focus on the human rights of women and women's involvement in sex work and sex trafficking (Bruch, 2004). This model was developed in the women's-rights-as–human-rights policy movement in the 1990s. This perspective purports that the human trafficking experiences of women are seen as human rights violations. The frameworks based on the human rights model shift focus away from men who have been trafficked and individuals who may have experienced labor trafficking (Alvarez & Alessi, 2012).

Each of these models fails to examine the multi-faceted issue of preventing human trafficking from multiple perspectives (Bruch, 2004; Weitzer, 2014). Thus, prevention efforts have not yet successfully led to a decrease in human trafficking, as they have not approached the issue in a holistic way. Additionally, these models exclude the participation of victims in prevention efforts and do not create suitable alternatives for current trafficking victims (e.g. job and skills trainings, education, housing, safety, etc.) in order to prevent previous victims from becoming vulnerable to being exploited again (Alvarez & Alessi, 2012).

Best practices within anti-trafficking prevention have not yet been identified, though research discusses practices that have not worked well. For example, tighter border control has led to an increase in trafficking as third parties are being used to smuggle victims out of the country (Feingold, 2005). Legalizing prostitution has seen an increase in the number of women and children being trafficked into the sex industry (Cho et al., 2013; Feingold, 2005). Unfortunately, it is currently difficult to monitor anti-human trafficking models and to determine successful prevention mechanisms, and the UN Protocol still has no agreed upon monitoring mechanism for policy implementation (Van Dijk & Klerx-Van Mierlo, 2014).

Prosecution

Identifying, arresting, and prosecuting traffickers are all aspects of the 'prosecution' arm of anti-trafficking policies. In this criminal justice framework, law enforcement and judiciary are the bridge between human trafficking victims and their access to services. Although victims of human trafficking need additional services, their needs are often subsumed under efforts to prosecute traffickers (Sadruddin et al., 2005; Hyland, 2001; Verhoeven & van Gestel, 2011). Centering anti-trafficking efforts on criminal justice responses emphasizes criminal punishment as the main means of protection, prevention, and prosecution (De Leon, 2010; Iroanya, 2014; Kaye et al., 2014). This draws attention and resources away from victims' services and intricately intertwines the arrest and conviction of traffickers with services for human trafficking victims. Victims' cooperation and testimony with law enforcement is typically needed during prosecution; this cooperation from victims greatly depends on the quality and consistency of services provided to them (Farrell et al., 2014; Kaye et al., 2014; Sadruddin et al., 2005).

Law enforcement officials, namely police patrol officers, are likely the first points of contact for victims of trafficking. However, research has shown that these individuals are not likely to have received training on how to best communicate and interact with human trafficking victims in ways that empower and encourage them to continue to cooperate with police (Barrick et al., 2014; Farrell & Pfeffer, 2014; Farrell et al., 2014; Verhoeven & van Gestel, 2011). Without providing proper skills to officers, victims can become re-victimized and cease their communication and cooperation with law enforcement, thereby hindering the investigation and prosecution process and limiting their access to services.

Officials in law enforcement also lack training on how to identify human trafficking victims. Victims of human trafficking are a diverse population; to be able to identify human trafficking victims who might not show obvious signs of trauma is a difficult task that requires experience and knowledge about trafficking (Clawson et al., 2009; Caliber, 2007; Zillah, 2011). Since victims are unlikely to identify themselves as such, it is crucial that law enforcement be able to appropriately screen and identify victims. Unfortunately, a lack of training leads law enforcement to rely on personal experiences or faulty perceptions (Barrick et al., 2014; Farrell et al., 2014; Kaye et al., 2014). For example, as human trafficking becomes more known, the focus of media attention on minor sex trafficking has created a barrier to training officers to properly identify trafficking in adult victims (Barrick et al., 2014; Farrell & Pfeffer, 2014). Additionally, law enforcement officials are less likely to pursue human trafficking investigations because they may seem overly complex, fragile, time consuming, and lengthy (Verhoeven & van Gestel, 2011; Farrell et al., 2014). This perception leads to the belief that trafficking cases may waste resources, which is detrimental to efforts to prosecute traffickers and to serve victims.

Studies focusing on the prosecution of traffickers show that most countries that use a criminal justice approach, based on the Palermo Protocol, focus on the number of successful prosecutions of traffickers rather than on the number of victims assisted. Thus, this approach has not decreased the number of human trafficking victims (Sadruddin, 2005; De Leon, 2010; Farrell & Pfeffer, 2014; Keo et al., 2014).

So far, there have been no prosecution practices proven to be successful in preventing future

trafficking or holding traffickers accountable. Researchers have recommended policies to place less emphasis on the prosecution of traffickers and more effort on providing training to police officers and other professionals who are likely to come in contact with victims. All of the suggestions in the literature are similar; they emphasize the importance of victim-centered approaches, especially in prosecution procedures. Victims should be empowered throughout all of their interactions with the criminal justice system, thus providing a strong foundation for healing.

The Fourth P: Partnerships

Since its inception in 2000, there has been much discussion, analysis and research on the 3P Framework created by the Palermo Protocol. In the 2010 Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report, U.S. Secretary of State Hillary Clinton observed the progress that had been made in the international community in human trafficking protection, prevention and prosecution. Secretary Clinton also recognized the inability of governments, agencies and organizations to successfully prevent, protect and prosecute human trafficking on their own and suggested the addition of a fourth P: partnerships (Clinton, 2009; U.S. Dept. of State, 2010). Knowledge, victories, challenges and skills should be exchanged between government bodies, non-profit organizations, community-based organizations and service providers to create comprehensive, sustainable and dynamic anti-trafficking strategies. Partnerships and collaboration are essential in providing modes of protection, prevention and prosecution, as well as in supporting growth and invention in anti-trafficking strategies (Clinton, 2009). Connecting all potential actors through partnerships is key to ending the cycle of human trafficking by addressing the individual, organizational and sociopolitical contexts that aid in the growth of human trafficking (Jones et al., 2007). Partnerships can help to create a multifaceted solution to address complex set of factors that accompany the issue of human trafficking (Van Impe, 2000).

Current Gaps in Knowledge and Research

Existing literature on human trafficking is vast but repetitive. Many studies focus on sex trafficking, rather than labor trafficking, and a majority of the information focuses on trafficking of minors instead of the trafficking experiences of adults. Researchers repeatedly seek to explore the breadth and depth of the issue, and many studies reach two of same conclusions: First, service providers and first responders (i.e., anyone who comes into contact with victims of human trafficking) should receive proper training on:

- What human trafficking might look like,
- How to identify victims,
- How to interact/communicate with victims (empowering rather than re-victimizing),
- The complexity of trauma that human trafficking victims experience,
- The multitude of interrelated immediate, short-term and long-term services that victims may need, and
- How to tailor interventions to human trafficking victims from a variety of cultures.

Ultimately, in order to best serve human trafficking victims, comprehensive and culturally sensitive training is necessary at every step of the intervention process. Service providers must account for the nuances of trauma and the complications it may bring, and agencies must understand how to collaborate and create holistic intervention plans to best serve their clients.

Medical providers, social service agencies, and law enforcement need more comprehensive training to identify signs of human trafficking (Hodge, 2014; Dovydaitis, 2010). Although every case is different, there are some indicators that victims of trafficking may present (Wisconsin Office of Justice Assistance, 2012). Social workers in health clinics, emergency rooms and homeless shelters have an opportunity to identify human trafficking victims and intervene while victims are in their care (Hodge, 2014). As social workers are often the first point of contact, it is crucial for social workers to have proper training in this area. These points of connection are crucial steps in serving a population that is often isolated and controlled by others.

Second, because of the varied nature of the services (i.e. physical and mental health care, law enforcement, housing, religious services, and public assistance), providers should be in communication with each other to ensure that broad categories of needs are accounted for and do not overlap. Different agencies may be offering similar services to victims while also creating gaps in service provision (Baker & Grover, 2013). Indeed, with a lack of available funding for social services, agencies have a vested interest in working together to streamline services to avoid spending money on the same programs twice.

Services offered to victims are the most successful when service providers, governments, law enforcement, and physical and mental health providers collaborate. Whether organizations share information, services or resources, they should be working together to offer comprehensive services to human trafficking victims (Hodge, 2014). Any anti-trafficking intervention has to be holistic and collaborative across agencies and disciplines. The intention is to increase knowledge on trafficking victim identification and comprehensive service provision, as well as to prevent future incidents of human trafficking and prosecute traffickers (Hodge, 2014).

Although recommendations consistently emphasize the importance of training, there have been few studies that evaluate the impact of training on service provision and which trainings are most effective (Dovydaitis, 2010; Hodge, 2014). Yet, because the field of human trafficking is relatively new, an instinct remains to endorse education and awareness through training. Ultimately, training and collaboration for service providers who work with human trafficking victims are recommendations rather than ‘best practices’ (Hodge, 2014).

Methods

A qualitative approach was used to gather and analyze data from interviews with providers who have expertise in working with human trafficking victims. Speaking with providers with a variety of perspectives and experiences from 26 different countries across six different continents allowed for a more comprehensive and multi-faceted illustration of what might be considered to be best practices in work with human trafficking victims. Additionally, the data collected from interviews was compared to current research on human trafficking and what the literature suggests may be best practices in regards to working with victims. It is important to note that the information collected in the interviews was **not** confidential. The choice to gather non-confidential data was made after careful deliberation by Safe Horizon and the VAWC research team. Ultimately, it was decided this would be the most beneficial approach as the goal of the project was to aid in the development of a network between the providers who were interviewed for the project and the Anti-Trafficking Program team at Safe Horizon. Prior to conducting this

research project, researchers from the VAWC received approval from the University's Institutional Review Board (IRB).

Interviews

Sample. The research team used several recruitment strategies to secure 30 participants from 26 different countries representing most of the continents. We began using a snowball sampling method to gather potential participants' contact information. A list of contacts familiar to VAWC and ATP was used as a starting point for reaching out to organizations. The research team developed a spreadsheet that tracked the following:

- Participants' contact information,
- Their organization affiliation,
- Where their organization or agency was based,
- The types of human trafficking their work focused on,
- When and how they were contacted by VAWC or ATP staff,
- If they accepted or refused the invitation to participate in the project, and
- When their interview was conducted.

An invitation to participate in the research project, including the purpose of the project, was sent via email to this list of contacts. After participants accepted and confirmed the invitation to be interviewed, they were asked to recommend and provide contact information for other providers who might be interested in participating.

To ensure that a more diverse pool of participants would be reached, the research team then began using online human trafficking directories and lists of partner organizations from umbrella anti-human trafficking organizations (e.g. GAATW, End Slavery Now, etc.) to build the list of potential participants. Additionally, the research team used Internet search engines to search for and learn about other potential organizations that could be recruited for the project. Invitations to participate in the study were sent via email to these potential participants. If no response was received after one initial invitation and one reminder email, the organizations were contacted via phone. The ATP team also used their extensive relationships with international anti-trafficking organizations to contact potential participants via phone and email. Using all of these resources, the research team was able to conduct interviews with 30 participants representing 30 different organizations from 26 countries across six continents between November 2015 and May 2016. (Please see Appendix A for a detailed list of participants).

Participant organizations or related agencies served a range of victims, including but not limited to: women, men, adolescents, adults, labor trafficking victims, sex trafficking victims, domestically trafficked persons, and persons trafficked across national borders. Generally, the groups that organizations were able to offer services were determined by government policy, social or cultural norms, the most common forms of exploitation in that country/region, and the other types of organizations providing services for human trafficking victims.

A range of models and approaches was described by participants. Although there were different labels for the strategies or frameworks that shaped service provision, most of the participants described the incorporation of empowerment and respect into their organization's approach to working with victims of human trafficking. A majority of the participants recognized that a

victim-centered approach can be beneficial for the victim as well as other parties such as law enforcement or prosecution teams. Participants found that by placing the empowerment of and respect for victims at the center of their approaches, victims were more likely to develop trust with them and benefit from services provided.

Data Collection. A total of 30 interviews were conducted. Each interview lasted between 30 and 152 minutes; most averaged around an hour. Interviewers used Skype to contact participants directly using the participant's Skype username or the participant's preferred phone number. All of the interviews were audio recorded. At the beginning of the interview, we reminded each participant was reminded that the data collected from the project would not be confidential. The researcher also reminded the participants that they were not required to answer any questions that they did not want to answer. Additionally, the interviewer confirmed that the participant had reviewed the informed consent form, and answered any questions that the participant had about the project. The participant then provided verbal consent to participate in the interview.

Most of the interviews (25) were conducted in English. One interview was interpreted from Latvian to English during the live interview by one of the employees at the organization. Additionally, five interviews were conducted in Spanish. A bilingual member of the research team communicated and conducted interviews in Spanish with participants from organizations in various countries in North, Central and South America where it was difficult to find providers with English fluency. All interview materials were translated to Spanish for these purposes.

Instrument. A semi-structured, open-ended interview guide was used during interviews. Safe Horizon's Research & Evaluation team, along with Safe Horizon's Anti-Trafficking Program, consulted with the VAWC research team in the development of the interview guide. The interview guide included questions about how the participants viewed the needs of trafficking victims, how their organization sought to meet those needs, and if/how perspectives of their organization, government, culture or communities helped to shape the services and resources offered to human trafficking victims.

Data Analysis. Following each interview, the researcher uploaded the interview audio file onto a password-protected secure folder on the Rutgers University, School of Social Work server, accessible to only members of the research team. Within 24 hours of conducting the interview, the interviewer listened to the audio recording of the interview and took thorough notes. For interviews conducted in Spanish, the bilingual researcher listened to the audio recording twice and took thorough notes in English. These notes were then uploaded to the same password-protected secure folder on the server housing the audio files. The notes were then reviewed and compared to the audio recording by another member of the research team to ensure accuracy. For the interviews conducted in Spanish, a second bilingual member of the research team reviewed the notes in English and compared them to the audio recording.

Once the notes were finalized, two members of the research team independently analyzed the notes from three interviews (each from a different region of the world: Africa, Europe and North America). Using NVivo, a qualitative analysis software, the researchers then developed codes representing concepts found in participants' responses. After preliminary code lists were developed, the entire research team met to compare the lists and reconcile discrepancies. Over

96% of the researchers' initial codes overlapped and the remaining codes identified unique concepts. In the meeting where these code lists were discussed, the team consolidated these codes into categories based on underlying similarities. These categories were used to analyze all 30 interviews. After all of the interviews were analyzed, the project coordinator met with the research team to merge the categories into two overarching themes.

In addition to the list of thematic codes, the research team decided to also include codes that would highlight the cultural differences between the interviews. These codes helped to capture the variety of sociopolitical, cultural, and organizational contexts that impact a participant's attitudes, beliefs and perspectives on the issue of human trafficking, what services can be considered effective or successful, and what challenges impact how providers work with human trafficking victims. One member of the research team examined the research notes once more through the lens of cultural difference in response to and prevention of human trafficking. This involved the application of both general codes relevant in multiple settings and specific codes that highlighted distinct manifestations of difference. After coding for cultural differences in all interviews, the researcher met with the project coordinator to place the codes into existing categories and develop new categories to capture unique cultural difference codes that did not fit into existing thematic categories. These existing and unique categories were placed under the two themes previously developed by the research team.

Results

Throughout the interviews, participants described variation in victim needs. However, a majority of the participants reported that victims sought safety and security over anything else. In each of the interviews, participants described the variety of services offered to meet the needs of clients. Participants also reported that these needs would change over time, and that organizations should be able to provide for victims' short and long-term needs. As such, two major themes emerged from the interviews with participants: 1) What Works, and 2) Challenges Encountered. Participants provided illustrations of how the individual experiences of victims are shaped by organizational-level factors as well as by cultural, social and political contexts within the country, region and international communities. Both themes are comprised of multiple subthemes, which will be described in relation to their corresponding theme. Quotations from the interview notes are included to illustrate the themes and subthemes. Some direct quotes from research notes are used throughout this report. While all efforts were made to quote participants as accurately as possible, these quotes may not have been transcribed word-for-word. The quotes presented in this report have been edited to correct grammatical errors.

What Works

When talking about what works with survivors, participants discussed the strategies, practices, and polices they considered to be successful or effective. In particular, participants spoke about the competencies and passions of their staff, the flexibility of their organizations, and efforts to collaborate with other entities. Additionally, participants communicated successes around effective anti-trafficking policies, funding, and the use of media as an awareness tool.

a. Competent and passionate staff

During interviews, participants spoke about the aspects of their organizations and services that helped them best work with human trafficking victims. Some of the interviewees discussed the importance of having a trained and passionate staff. Participants explained that staff needed training in order to understand the complexity of human trafficking and its impact on victims. With training, organizations could facilitate staff's empowerment of victims and help to ensure proper service provision. Because working with victims of human trafficking can be frustrating and overwhelming, participants emphasized how crucial it is to have staff and volunteers who are fueled by their desire to help victims.

> *"Their [the staff's] souls are here."* (Azhar Islam, Rights Jessore, Bangladesh)

> *"We stay persistent on behalf of our clients"* (Đurđica Kolarec, Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia)

Illustrated by the quotes above, passion was seen as crucial to persisting through difficulties that organizations or service providers could encounter when working with victims. Passion helps organizations to stay engaged with their victims and continue to offer services.

b. Adaptability

Along with passionate and trained staff, interviewees also spoke about the benefits of having flexible services or programs. Having the ability to mold services or programs to fit the specific needs of a victim is key in working with clients. Rather than utilizing one uniform program that victims must adhere to, participants touted the advantage of having victims play an active role in the development of individual interventions and services.

> *"We are versatile in understanding women and their needs."* (Yanar Mohammed, OWFI, Iraq)

Yanar Mohammed's quote helps to illustrate the significance of an organization's ability to remain flexible and dynamic in meeting the needs of victims. This adaptability is also vital in developing lasting relationships with government bodies or other organizations. To continue to work with human trafficking victims, an organization needs to recognize how human trafficking and its victims may change over time. Demonstrating extensive knowledge about the issue can help an organization to develop trusting relationships with the communities that it seeks to help.

> *"It is always an evolving process: what we started and how we started 15 years ago has taken a completely different shape from today."* (Supriya Awasthi, Free the Slaves, India)

The above quote highlights the importance of versatility in the services and programming of an organization doing anti-trafficking work. Policies and services have to evolve as the understanding of human trafficking and how to best work with victims evolves. As conceptions of the issue change, organizations need to adapt to be able to meet victims' needs and the requirements of government policies.

c. Collaboration

Additionally, the need for collaboration with outside organizations was described as key in providing needed services to victims. A majority of the participants discussed their inability to provide all of the services that their clients needed in-house. However, rather than allowing victims to go without, their organizations partnered with other outside organizations, agencies, schools, or groups that were providing what they could not. In some cases, certain services were simply out of the scope of what their organizations could offer. In other cases, partner organizations were able to provide services in locations that the participant's organization could not currently reach.

> *"We have 70 partners and we work very strongly with them, but every partner has a local network of partners for health issues, social issues, and French lessons. We work with our 50 shelters and 20 NGO's and then they work with local partners and service providers of other NGO's."* (Federica Marengo, ACSE, France)

> *"We have a large referral network, about 90 partner organizations…Networks and connections have been essential to our organization's success."* (Stephanie Richard, CAST, USA)

These quotes from Federica Marengo and Stephanie Richard explain what an ideal network of collaborating organizations might look like. ACSE is able to provide services in many different parts of France via their partners, and they are also able to connect victims with a wide variety of services that they are not able to provide on their own. On the other hand, CAST's large network of partners allows the organization to provide a wide range of specialized services for their large client base in Los Angeles County in California. Both of these large collaboration networks allow the organizations to expand the breadth or depth of their services.

Other organizations recruit volunteers to expand services and assist with other tasks that staff do not have the time or resources to regularly do, such as painting fences. House of Hope is a faith-based organization and has capitalized the organization's connections to faith-based communities by recruiting volunteers from other Christian organizations and church groups.

> *"Groups that come to volunteer with our organization are all from other countries, they come from the U.K., Argentina, Spain. We have groups like Christian Medical and Dental Organization that come twice a year- we may have 60 doctors a year from this group. There are also individuals, couples, church groups, including a group from Texas of rising high school teens who will paint back fence. We have a lot of work to do and are happy for willing hands. If someone has a skill they can use, we'll put it to work. There are also missionaries that contact us about opportunities to help."* (April Havlin, House of Hope, Nicaragua)

Not many other participants discussed the use of volunteers which may be due to concerns around safety and confidentiality of their clients.

Participants also described collaborations with local schools or artisans to provide clients with education and vocational skills; others partner with lawyers or doctors to provide specialized help for victims.

> *"We collaborate with other local organizations. For example, there is one organization where victims receive training three times a week to make jewelry from a seed that is grown locally. The organization then sells the jewelry and gives profit to clients so they have a salary and a small fund of money when they leave [the program]."* (Veronica Supliguicha, Alas de Colibri, Ecuador)

Alas de Colibri is unable to provide training to victims, so they have built partnerships with local organizations and subsequently developed a program that benefits the victims by facilitating skills training and helping the victims make a small income to support themselves. Other participants also discussed collaborating with local organizations to provide legal services, health care, housing or other types of services in addition to skills trainings. Participants also mentioned collaborating with other organizations to evaluate the impact of their services and programs. Finally, in order to fill service gaps, participants expressed the need to collaborate with government bodies and law enforcement.

> *"Successful organizations are successful because they work well together with the police and the prosecution."* (Michelle Mildwater, HopeNow, Demark)

In addition to collaborating with other organizations to expand services, participants described how these partnerships are a means for ensuring that policies being created are well-informed, and implemented in a victim-centered manner. Developing a positive relationship with police and prosecution can be beneficial for human trafficking victims by providing a friendly face and reminders of how to effectively and appropriately interact with a victim.

Participants also described how they partner with international governments.

> *"We have a strong partnership with the United States that has allowed us to sustain our efforts to combat human trafficking in Cameroon. Some of our programs are based on U.S. government [financial] support."* (Justice Prudence Galega, Nku'mu Fed Fed, Cameroon)

In the case of this organization, the funding and resources from the United States have been extremely beneficial when Nku'mu Fed Fed struggled to find funding from the Cameroonian government. This example of collaboration has helped to provide services for victims by providing resources to make those services possible.

Finally, though collaboration happens between organizations, collaboration can also happen within an organization. Some participants discussed the benefits of having a multidisciplinary team; promoting internal collaboration helps shape a program to provide services for multiple aspects of their lives.

> *"The Anti-Trafficking program has both legal and case management on site. Having those two teams working together allows us to provide holistic services for trafficking victims. We are able to come at them with a variety of perspectives. [Victims] are complex human being with complex issues that need multiple types of services. Our model is successful because we have a policy piece that is informed by the daily work of legal and case management teams."* (Griselda Vega, Safe Horizon, United State of America)

As Vega mentioned above, each victim has a unique and complex set of needs and having a collaborative team helps to promote empowerment and healing for the victim in several parts of their lives.

d. Having effective policies & funding

When discussing policy, participants described the importance of government recognition that human trafficking impacts their country. They also stressed the importance that the government recognizes all types of victims of human trafficking; who they recognize as a "legitimate" victim influences policy implementation.

> *"Trafficking has become an issue that more people are becoming aware of, at least within the past year. The UK government has just passed a bill that has been heralded by the media. [This law] "The Modern Slavery Act" focuses on combatting human trafficking…and has produced a lot of media attention on the issue of human trafficking."* (Carita Thomas, ATLEU, United Kingdom)

ATLEU's Carita Thomas explains how a government's public recognition of human trafficking through policy can help to generate public awareness and public interest in the issue. Many participants discussed their hopes that government recognition and the subsequent increased public interest in the issue might yield more support for victim services.

All of the participants cited funding as a major challenge, but a few of the interviewees mentioned some success in securing additional resources. One of the most prominent examples of an organization developing a strong funding base was Coalition to Abolish Slavery and Trafficking (CAST), based in Los Angeles. During the interview, CAST's representative, Stephanie Richard, mentioned a few examples of funding, including the two million dollar endowment that gave the organization a strong foundation, and the current ten million dollars in the California state budget allotted to human trafficking victim services. When asked how CAST secured such a large funding base, Stephanie replied:

> *"[CAST made] The institutional decision to provide quality [of services] over quantity."* (Stephanie Richard, CAST, USA)

This quote demonstrates that funding can result from focusing on the effectiveness of services rather than the amount of services provided. Other participants discussed difficulty in obtaining sufficient resources to be able to provide quality services and the subsequent outcomes needed to

obtain more funding. It is also important to note the interrelatedness of policy and funding; the effectiveness of one greatly impacts the effectiveness of the other.

> *"[CECASEM is] trying to work on public policies because if there aren't resources, then nothing happens; if there isn't a law saying who has to do what and where the funds are going to come from, nothing happens…If the police don't have the money to go…and investigate, then nothing happens; you can report trafficking but nothing happens."* (Patricia Bustamante, CECASEM, Bolivia).

The above quote from Patricia Bustamante from Centro de Capacitación y Servicios para la Integración de la Mujer (CECASEM) illustrates the relationship between effective policies and funding mechanisms. Without an infrastructure created by policy and supported by resources, any work done to help human trafficking victims may be short-term. Successful policies help to produce financial and administrative resources for organizations, law enforcement and government bodies to protect victims, prevent future trafficking, and aid in the prosecution of trafficking.

> *"When there is a victim, there is a trafficker and there is an investigation process. The legal process always follows its course based on whether the victim wants to take part or not. The victim has the right to not take part in the investigation and prosecution and that right is respected…If she does participate, she is guaranteed legal representation and protection and security so she is not exposed and not put in danger. They work hard not to re-victimize the victims that participate in the legal proceedings."* (Rosa Corea, CICESCT, Honduras)

Corea's explanation of Honduran policy in regards to victim testimony demonstrates how a legal system can be victim-centered and also complete investigations on human trafficking and prosecution of traffickers without forcing a victim to testify. There were few participants that mentioned victims were not obligated to participate in investigations or prosecution procedures. Often human trafficking victims are required to cooperate with law enforcement and prosecution teams, placing them at risk for being retraumatized or endangered. Allowing victims the choice to participate is beneficial for both law enforcement/prosecution as well as the victim. Victims are then more apt to cooperate with government law enforcement and prosecution, and they also have the opportunity to heal according to the timeline that works best for them. Policies that offer victims a choice are policies that help victim reclaim their autonomy.

e. Using media as an awareness tool

With the widespread use of social media and technology, some participants discussed the advantages of using these tools for service provision. Some organizations, like Lighthouse and CURB (Caribbean Umbrella body for Restorative Behaviour), have developed their own tools to spread awareness about human trafficking and help reach out to victims. Lighthouse created a smart phone application that provides information on human trafficking, and staff members regularly communicate with people who have questions about the issue using this application. Similarly, HAART has used their Facebook and Twitter accounts to help victims.

> *"There was a group of Kenyan women who had been trafficked to Libya…and one reached out [to HAART] through Facebook. [HAART staff] communicated through Facebook and WhatsApp to get women to Kenyan embassy. Eventually, HAART was able to partner with Kenyan government and IOM to get women back to Kenya"* (Sophie Otiende, HAART, Kenya)

Sophie Oteinde's story shows how social media can be used as a tool by service providers to help victims. The story illustrates how social media is a powerful instrument that can help individual victims, in addition to spreading awareness to the general public about the issue.

> *"There has been a lot of on the ground learning. That's why I felt that it was important to share information on human trafficking with anyone that wanted to learn about human trafficking, and I developed an open-source library when I founded Chab Dai."* (Helen Sworn, Chab Dai, Cambodia)

This above quote shows that another means of harnessing the power of media. Noting how little the public in Cambodia knew about human trafficking and how little resources were available to develop awareness campaigns, Sworn collected resources and began to make them available through Chab Dai's website. By placing information on human trafficking online and free for anyone, Chab Dai made this information more accessible for individuals to understand what human trafficking is and how they could help prevent it. Though this approach was admittedly time-consuming, this information is permanently available for anyone who wants to learn more about the issue.

f. Measuring success

Many of the individuals who were interviewed discussed how they evaluated the success of their services and of their clients. There were a variety of perspectives on this topic, but each of the participants mentioned the significance of evaluating programs in a way that respected the individual needs of clients.

> *"Measuring success should be done in respect to empowering the victim: [their trafficking experience] was not their fault, they are not a criminal, what happened to them is not their identity. Outcomes should be a reframing of [their] trafficking and their role in the experience."* (Adrian Alexander, CURB, Trinidad & Tobago).

As the above quote explains, measuring success of services should be victim-centered. By using an empowering framework to develop program outcomes, the needs of victims can remain the focus of a program. When an organization focuses on only measuring empirical outcomes, the psychological and emotional support that is essential in human trafficking victim services may wane.

> *"We measure success with client-created milestones, such as: getting a T-visa, renting an apartment, bringing their family to the United States. Case managers work with clients, always going back to that plan and checking in with the client to see if any of the milestones have changed."* (Griselda Vega, Safe Horizon, United States of America)

This approach to developing empirical outcomes, as described by Safe Horizon's Vega, demonstrates a balance between clients' needs and an organization's need for empirical evidence. By incorporating a client's self-described goals, each set of outcomes is specific to each individual client's needs. But setting these milestones also allows Safe Horizon to measure how services may be impacting a client and thereby demonstrate their services' effectiveness. Additionally, it is important to note that the goals that clients set are not static. Clients are able to adjust their goals as their needs may change, thusly maintaining a victim-centered approach to measuring their success.

Challenges Encountered

Participants discussed a number of barriers encountered with relation to the provision of services for human trafficking victims. Challenges in victim identification, service provision, and collaboration with others were all focused on during these discussions. Participants also highlighted the impact of poor policies and problems with the media as barriers in anti-human trafficking work.

a. Challenges in victim identification

Law enforcement and other government entities were described as influencing the manner in which services are implemented and the means for identifying human trafficking victims. Even when mechanisms were built with the intent to help service providers or victims of human trafficking, the operation of those mechanisms had the potential to hinder anti-trafficking work when not utilized properly.

> *"Police have not called the Centre for at least 3 years, despite the formal agreement [with the Centre]. If victims are not officially identified by National Police, victims do not have right to access services through state support program."* (Đurđica Kolarec, Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia)

Victim identification can be difficult because of poor program implementation, as illustrated above, but the subtle coercive nature of human trafficking can also prevent victims from self-identifying or prevent others from identifying victims. Veronica Supliguicha's explanation of how individuals can fall victim to exploitation through the creation of a relationship fantasy illustrates how victims may not understand that they are being trafficked, and therefore are unlikely to identify themselves as such.

> *"In the majority of cases…the mode of captivity is through seduction or falling in love. It's a fantasy that they think they have a boyfriend, a spouse, or a husband, but really this is the person that is exploiting them."* (Veronica Supliguicha, Alas de Colibri, Ecuador)

Participants found that victims would not self-identify for a multitude of reasons, such as fear for their own or their family's safety, and this posed a challenge to their ability to identify and provide services to victims.

> *"How do we identify victims? It is not a simple answer. We do not directly access [victims] because they live in fear, especially those who live with their trafficker. Instead, we work to establish rapport with high-risk communities- this takes time, we must identify the vulnerable pockets [of people] and then spend time developing a relationship with them."* (Supriya Awasthi, Free the Slaves, India)

As the above quote illustrates, it is sometimes difficult to identify victims because they are fearful and isolated. In some cases, as highlighted by the quote from Awasthi, victims are kept from seeking help by their trafficker. In order to counter this isolation, Free the Slaves and other participant organizations developed trusting relationships with communities in order to encourage victims to self-identify or community members to identify a potential victim.

b. Addressing Stigma

Even when victims are identified, the stigma that comes with the label of 'human trafficking victim' has the potential to negatively affect the quality of treatment that victims receive from service providers or other officials. In some cases, victims are victimized by the people responsible for helping them.

> *"The survivor spoke…about her experience where police had come in and raped her instead of rescuing her*." (Rosi Orozco, Comision Unidos Vs Trata, Mexico)

> *"[Male clients] will not disclose sexual abuse…because they will be embarrassed by police"* (Helen Sworn, Chab Dai, Cambodia)

Experiences like the ones above serve as examples of what organizations are attempting to prevent when working with human trafficking victims. Participants discussed how poor treatment of victims by law enforcement, community members or others create additional challenges in providing services to victims. Stigmatization or further exploitation may result when victims of trafficking disclose their trafficking experiences. When victims do disclose, their trafficking experiences are sometimes ignored; only actions that correlate with other parts of the victim's experience are deemed relevant.

> *"When police find these victims, they are labeled as refugees or asylum seekers and "the whole issue of trafficking takes a backseat"* (Sophie Otiende, HAART, Kenya)

Several participants discussed the issue of discounting the reality of having been trafficked, as mentioned by Sophie Otiende. Other aspects of a victim's journey would be highlighted (i.e. migration, smuggling, prostitution, distribution or use of substances) while the exploitation piece was ignored. In some instances, human trafficking victims would be mislabeled as refugees or asylum seekers. Ignoring a part of a victim's trauma experience, like human trafficking, creates a barrier in terms of identifying and providing the services that they need to receive.

c. Challenges collaborating with others

Although collaboration was discussed as a necessary means for providing services to victims, it was also identified as a challenging aspect of participants' work. These challenges were described as stemming from when partner organizations or government authorities had varied perspectives on human trafficking and victim services. These differences in opinion and approach to the issue could make it difficult to work together to improve service provision for victims.

> *"The coherency of the members in the council is low, there is a tendency for each of the members to take individualized actions rather than coordinated actions*." (Nurul Hasanah and Paremeswari Subramaniam, SUHAKAM, Malaysia).

As the SUHAKAM staff explain in the above quote, it is difficult to collaborate when actors are not of the same mind. The Malaysian government's Anti-Trafficking Council, an attempt at collaboration between government authorities and community-based groups, resulted in separate actions by many parties instead of a coordinated response. When priorities and perspectives clash, policy implementation and victims services become disjointed actions rather than a united strategy. In other cases, participants discussed their government's unwillingness to collaborate, as well as the government's denial that human trafficking was a concern.

> *"There was more or less total denial of the issues of trafficking and prostitution taking place on a large scale in Iraqi society… In 2009, an activist that works for OWFI was interviewed on a local news story, and…before the show aired…the Iraqi government intervened by contacting the news station to not air the interview."* (Yanar Mohammed, OWFI, Iraq)

Yanar Mohammed's story of conflict with the Iraqi government is one example that shows how a government's refusal to recognize the issue of human trafficking as a priority issue can halt collaboration with service providers. By not acknowledging the existence of human trafficking, a government can disregard responsibility to address it, and ignore organizations' call to collaborate.

Another challenge organizations encounter when trying to collaborate with other organizations is the attitudes and beliefs around trafficking and its victims. Because sex trafficking is not well understood and many people do not understand the complex coercion that can result in sexual exploitation, many organizations find it difficult to partner with other individuals or organizations. Other participants discussed how biases against women in sex trafficking negatively impact available funding and resources, in addition to successful partnerships with other organizations.

> *"Employees who run other shelter programs are quite old fashioned and set in their ways, so we sometimes find it difficult to collaborate with them"* (Natalie Ogden, Red Light Anti-Human Trafficking Initiative, South Africa)

d. Ineffective policies & limited funding

Other challenges that were identified by participants included the impact of ineffective or poorly implemented policies and the lack of funding on their work with victims. The political environment and the influence of international laws also play a role in the effectiveness of policy related to service provision for victims. As described previously, recognition of human trafficking as an issue of concern and recognition of victims has the potential to help or hinder the effectiveness of policy in this area. A significant part of anti-human trafficking policy is how a government defines human trafficking. In turn, this definition shapes what constitutes human trafficking and who victims may be, and thus to whom and how services are provided. The ability of trafficking to morph and change on the ground has implications for this as well.

> *"Criminals are always going to be a step ahead of the law…There are always new forms of trafficking that are forming that have to be identified by society and government before being able to provide services."* (Gita Miruškina, Safe House, Latvia)

This quote captures a common thread that ran through several interviews: human trafficking is always changing to stay undetected. This makes it difficult to make policy that addresses all forms of trafficking because changes in government are reactive. Service providers spoke about recognizing different types of human trafficking occurring in the field and waiting years before the government policy recognized them.

Some participants thought that inadequate anti-trafficking responses resulted from unclear or uncomprehensive human trafficking definitions in their national laws.

> *"The law doesn't specify between the different types of trafficking… [We] need to continue looking for different types of trafficking and learning about them so they can determine how to identify and provide services to victims."* (Rosa Corea, CICESCT, Honduras)

From this quote, it is clear that laws with definitions that are too broad can impact how organizations and the general public understand human trafficking, thereby influencing victim services and prevention efforts. Without defining the different types of human trafficking, a country can lack specialized services or responses needed for victims. Working from the bottom up, Comisión Interinstitucional Contra la Explotación Sexual Comercial y Trata de personas de Honduras (CICEST) is attempting to better inform the national anti-trafficking policy.

Another identified challenge in terms of policy was when a policy was nothing more than a piece of paper without much meaning. Participants discussed that even with anti-trafficking policies in place, some governments choose not to recognize certain victim groups, certain types of human trafficking, or they may choose to not recognize human trafficking as a significant issue at all.

> *"The government pays little attention to issue of human trafficking – worst social problem that affects girls and women in the Ido state. [They] only pay lip service to the issue."* (Nwoaha Roland, Idia Renaissance, Nigeria)

Nwoaha Roland's statement exemplifies that a government can have a policy that is greatly affecting its citizens while not recognizing human trafficking as a priority. There were several other participants that discussed a similar lack of recognition from their governments, claiming that the presence of a policy does not mean the government actually recognizes human trafficking as an issue of concern.

Many participants also discussed issues in the area of policy implementation during interviews. A majority of the participants spoke of ineffective or insufficient enactment of anti-trafficking policy. They described how a policy cannot successfully protect human trafficking victims if there is no means for executing it.

> *"Though the government passed an anti-trafficking law, there aren't means of implementing or monitoring implementation of the law"* (Justice Prudence Galega, Nku'mu Fed Fed, Cameroon)

As Justice Galega explains, without providing means for enacting a policy, it is ineffective. Without resources and support, a policy is nothing more than words. Implementation is the means of turning texts into victim protection and human trafficking prevention. An essential aspect of policy implementation is ensuring that those that are responsible for implementation understand the complexity of human trafficking cases and how trauma of human trafficking can impact a victim.

> *"Often, victims are told that police cannot take their case to court and so they are taken out of the program. Victims often can't remember the names of the brothels that they worked at or where the brothels were, and they can't remember the names of their traffickers. This means that a lot of these women are not 'good witnesses' so they do not meet the criteria of the program."* (Lena Sivasailam-Pichler, Project Respect, Australia)

The above quote illustrates how a policy intended to help victims can leave them without access to services because law enforcement does not recognize that trauma and mistrust can cause victims to have inconsistent stories or victims may have been isolated without knowledge about their whereabouts or who exploited them. Without having this knowledge, law enforcement can view victims as lying or unreliable which unfortunately disqualifies them for services in Australia.

Another challenge in anti-trafficking work results from policies not being used to properly address traffickers.

> *"The Romanian government does not confiscate assets of traffickers after they have been convicted…[The government] makes it less of a wonderful business rather than [offering] heavier sentences"* (Madalina Mocan, Centrul Ratiu pentru Democratie, Romania)

Without truly setting up a human trafficking as a high risk/low benefit crime, traffickers suffer a temporary setback before rejoining the human trafficking industry. Madalina Mocan's statement was similar to stories from other participants; the government does not aptly punish those

involved in human trafficking, and convictions are seen as minor obstacles for traffickers. Ultimately, this translates to incidents of human trafficking continuing and greater potential for victims to be re-trafficked.

Barriers at the organizational level impacted many aspects of the organizations' ability to provide services. The lack of funding and resources made available to them was identified in these discussions. One participant identified that it is not only the costs of implementing programs that need to be funded, but also other activities that can help bring a sense of normalcy during a victim's time with the organization.

> *"There is a cost that is not recognized, that is invisible. It is this whole quantity of money that is needed to open the avenue of possibilities to the victims. That means, not only is it to have a roof and to have food. Yes, but additionally, it is to have other forms of involvement in the community. Bring them to the movies. Bring them to the theater. Bring them to the park. Bring them to the pool, bring them to different places in which you open possibilities to them. And, also, they exercise the right to recreation."* (Veronica Supliguicha, Alas de Colibri, Ecuador)

Veronica Supliguicha's quote illustrates the importance of funding comprehensive services for victims, as their needs extend beyond safety and sustenance. The challenge, though, comes in determining who will pay for these extensive invisible costs. Even when costs are visible, some governments are opposed to funding services clearly linked to victim safety.

> *"The Iraqi government does not see their obligation to fund these programs to prevent Iraqi women from being in danger."* (Yanar Mohammed, OWFI, Iraq)

The above statement from Yanar Mohammed demonstrates the crux of the funding issue. There are many hefty costs to providing effective services for human trafficking victims, but there are few parties who feel responsible to cover those costs. Government may not feel responsible for paying for what could be considered recreational activities or for services targeting certain groups. Organizations may need to rely exclusively on (sometimes unreliable) external sources to provide services if the government does not prioritize victim services.

> *"The shelter is supported completely by external resources. We don't have State funds or financial support. We could do much more and have a better service if we had more resources."* (Heidi Hochstatter, Fundación Levántate Mujer y Congregación Nuestra Señora de la Caridad del Buen Pastor, Bolivia)

This quote from Heidi Hochstatter depicts the challenge of offering needed services to victims without government support. Although it is possible, the quality and breadth of services may suffer. For high quality programs to exist, an organization needs the figurative and financial support of the government in addition to the support of external resources.

Additionally, changes in the political environment can change the ways in which human trafficking policies are implemented. Even if a policy remains the same, changes in government priorities can alter the quantity, quality and type of services available to victims.

> *"A right-wing government has come to power…and the Church has a growing influence on the state. The main Church value is protection of family values and not of individuals."* (Đurđica Kolarec, Centre for Women War Victims, Croatia)

The above quote demonstrates that a shift in political ideology can impact service provision. Priorities in Croatia moved towards upholding traditional family values rather than individual human rights. Other participants mentioned a similar shift towards a more conservative political environment and spoke about the effect that politics have on victim services.

Part of the conversation about barriers also centered on the influence of international laws. The UN Palermo Protocol and The Trafficking in Persons Report are international standards for anti-trafficking policies. Participants described how these policies have influenced and shaped national responses to the issue. In some cases, countries align their services with what outside bodies providing aid might deem most important.

> *"Previously the government focused on foreign nationals as perpetrators because prosecution of these perpetrators gained the attention of embassies, NGOs, and TIP rankings."* (Helen Sworn, Chab Dai, Cambodia)

Helen Sworn's statement illustrates part of the unintended consequences of linking aid to standards set by an international body: a country will concentrate its anti-trafficking efforts on the perpetrators or victims that will gain the most praise. Rather than building a human trafficking response based on the specific context of the country, the government builds a strategy based on what aid-giving bodies may admire most. Some participants mentioned the influence that the U.S. Trafficking Victims Protection Act has had on the human trafficking field, but how different this conceptualization is from their own reality.

e. Challenges with media

Media was also identified as playing a large role in the human trafficking field. The way that human trafficking is presented by the news or in movies impacts the way that the general public perceives the problem. With media shaping ideas about what human trafficking looks like, it also shapes how victims view themselves. As Sophie Otiende explains below, the types of human trafficking that the media focuses on are the types that the public acknowledges.

> *"When these are the only types of trafficking that are discussed in the media, they are the only types of trafficking that are recognized by the public, but there are many other forms of trafficking that occur."* (Sophie Otiende, HAART, Kenya)

Media is also a tool used by traffickers to recruit or coerce victims. Media, particularly via social media and the Internet, can be used to further obfuscate a victim's conceptualization of what happened to them. Cyber trafficking often does not involve direct contact between victim and trafficker, and thereby does not fit the typical forms of trafficking discussed by the media. This can make it difficult for a victim of cyber trafficking to understand that they are a human trafficking victim. Visayan Forum Foundation considers cyber trafficking to be the use of online

forums (e.g. chat rooms, video chats, etc.) for the exploitation of individuals. For example, an individual uses a video chat to watch someone do sexual acts in exchange for money (Visayan Forum Foundation, 2015). Visayan Forum Foundation has found that this is a rampant issue amongst minor and young adult women in the Philippines.

> *"Cyber trafficking isn't seen as trafficking because there is no physical contact between victim and trafficker."* (Anita Teekah, Viasayan Forum Foundation, Philippines)

Illustrated by Anita Teekah's quote above, Viasayan Forum Foundation recognizes cyber trafficking as a form of human trafficking although it is not formally recognized by the government. This discrepancy makes it difficult for the public to be aware of the cyber trafficking phenomena. Because the government does not acknowledge this form of human trafficking, it is not classified as a crime. This creates a space for traffickers to legally use media to traffic victims.

f. Lack of measurable outcomes

Few organizations that were interviewed kept quantitative measures of service outcomes. Instead, they tended to evaluate services or programs using subjective outcomes generated from client perspectives. Successful outcomes were generally not quantified successes, but were more likely to be the observation of emotional transformation in a client.

> *"Success is…does the client feel safe? Do they feel vindicated? Even if that might not mean achieving what you think is a great legal victory."* (Carita Thomas, ATLEU, United Kingdom)

For these service providers, success was based on how clients define it for themselves. For many participants, successful outcomes were rooted in the victim's perspective.

> *"Definition of success: When she has really found God. When this happens, within three months, the girls are out of the program. As soon as they get who He is, something just shifts."* (Natalie Ogden, Red Light Anti-Human Trafficking Initiative, South Africa)

The above quote also illustrates how priorities of a faith-based service provider may be different than other types of organizations or agencies. Natalie Ogden described an approach that focused on faith-based outcomes, but also included the empowerment of victims. In this organization, this empowerment is envisioned as client-defined as well as related to the client's positive relationship with God.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The goal of this project, "Providing Services to Trafficking Victims: Understanding Best Practices Across the Globe", was to begin to explore best practices for service providers working with human trafficking victims. To achieve this goal, the research team from the Center on Violence Against Women and Children (VAWC) at Rutgers University first conducted a comprehensive literature review to establish the current state of the field. Then, the team

interviewed 30 service providers from 26 different countries across six continents to discuss their experiences and practice approaches when working with human trafficking victims. The data collected from these interviews was analyzed, and the findings were presented in this report. Two major themes emerged from the collected data: 1) What Works and 2) Challenges Encountered. Participants spoke not only about the practices or model they use in their work, but they also discussed how government policies and funding impacted the quality and quantity of their work in the field. The recommendations presented below were informed by literature and research on the topic, as well as by participants' responses to interview questions.

Recommendation 1: Acknowledge the interrelation of the 3Ps. The literature and the experiences provided by participants in their interviews illuminated the interconnectedness of the 3Ps (protection, prevention, prosecution). Efforts focusing on one P impact the effectiveness of strategies for the other two. To successfully prevent human trafficking, both comprehensive protection of victims and victim-centered prosecution procedures need to be implemented. Each aspect of anti-human trafficking work is equally important to the eradication of human trafficking, and should therefore receive the same amount of focus in the development and implementation of programs, services and policies.

Recommendation 2: Collaborate with human service organizations, civil society, and government. In interviews, participants repeatedly stressed the significance of collaboration. Namely, discussion in interviews focused on partnering with other local organizations and agencies to help provide comprehensive services to victims of human trafficking because it is not possible for any single organization to meet every need of every victim. To fill this gap in service, participants found collaboration with other providers to be beneficial for victims. Additionally, some participants spoke on their collaborative work with the government. These relationships with government bodies (e.g. state law enforcement, committees or departments) can help to shape more effective evidence-informed policies. Collaboration in the form of inter-country knowledge exchange on anti-trafficking practices would help to increase knowledge in the field and expand opportunities to develop evidence-based practices.

Recommendation 3: Mandate training for individuals or groups that are likely to come in contact with human trafficking victims. Throughout the interviews, participants discussed the lack of awareness and knowledge about human trafficking among those who interact with victims, and how this may negatively impact victims. It was emphasized that people who are more likely to interact with human trafficking victims, such as law enforcement, healthcare providers, and service providers should be trained in this area. Additionally, individuals who indirectly shape victims services should also receive training. Politicians, department directors and leaders in the community should attend trainings on human trafficking to better inform policies and programs developed to meet the needs of victims, as well as to increase awareness in the general public about the issue.

Recommendation 4: Incorporate culturally-sensitive practices into victim services. Each region, country, and community has different contexts that shape the experiences and needs of human trafficking victims. Participants stressed how cultural differences were vital to incorporate into the development of interventions as a way to properly meet the needs of victims. Culture impacts how the victim perceives their experience, their needs, and how to meet those

needs. So, providers should be able to modify services to incorporate culturally specific contexts into their practices. Most providers demonstrated that the goal of their work was to help victims of human trafficking. However, the ways in which they helped victims looked different because human trafficking victims, traffickers, and the act of human trafficking take different shapes in each culture and community.

Recommendation 5: Services, programs and policies need to be nuanced. Human trafficking victims can experience complex trauma, and each victim is impacted by this trauma differently. As such, they require services that focus on healing symptoms of trauma, and that empower them to reintegrate into society. It is also important for service providers to be able to tailor programs or services to meet victims' individual needs. The majority of participants emphasized the need for service providers to understand how trauma can affect a victim and how trafficking can shape the needs of victims. Additionally, programs and policies that acknowledge how the trauma from human trafficking can uniquely affect victims and their interactions with systems (e.g. law enforcement, prosecutions, human service organizations) will help to encourage healing and the development of autonomy and trust in victims.

Recommendation 6: Implement trauma-informed, holistic and comprehensive victim services. Discussion about the need for comprehensive services was common in the interviews with participants. Many participants highlighted the need for policies to incorporate a trauma-informed perspective that could also account for the particular needs of each victim. Services must recognize how deeply trauma may impact victims for their lifetimes. Comprehensive services seek to meet the immediate and long term needs of human trafficking victims. Victims often need safety and basic necessities, but they will also need other services to help them transition from victim to survivor. Long-term needs may include vocational training, education, housing, among others that are relevant to that particular context. Services that address these needs will empower victims, will aid in the recovery of their autonomy, and will provide them with alternatives to returning to the exploitation they have escaped.

Recommendation 7: Identify success, and ensure that it can be measured in outcomes. Many of the participants could not identify quantifiable outcomes of their anti-trafficking programs. Without measurable outcomes, it is difficult to collect evidence about an intervention and prove its effectiveness. Providers must be clear about how they define success and which outcomes correlate with that definition. To identify 'best practices' as such, measured success is required. In the pursuit to secure funding and resources, numerical evidence can be used by organizations to prove to funders or government bodies that their interventions are working. Furthermore, evaluating an intervention through analysis of data rather than anecdotes will make replication of these practices in other settings easier. It is also important to consider how success may be defined within various cultural contexts. Accounting for these differences could provide a more inclusive understanding of 'success' from both the victims' and providers' points of view. Additionally, a better understanding of how programmatic and victims' personal goals are achieved can be gleaned from well measured and clearly defined outcomes.

Recommendation 8: Utilize media partnerships and platforms to spread awareness and assist victims. Media is consumed and used by billions of people across the globe. Using the

pervasiveness of print, online, and broadcast media to an organization's advantage is key to truly increasing public understanding of human trafficking. During interviews, participants commonly mentioned using a variety of media platforms to reach a large audience and educate them about the issue of human trafficking. Some participants used the local or national news television programs, others produced films about human trafficking, and some participants also developed online resources for broad audiences. Social media platforms can also be utilized by providers; applications (apps) like Facebook, WhatsApp, Twitter, and self-created apps can be used as educational resources or to communicate with victims and guide them to safety.

Recommendation 9: Advocate for stronger anti-trafficking policies. A majority of the challenges encountered by participants centered on ineffective or poorly crafted policies as well as the challenge of poorly or inadequate implementation of those policies. It is vital for providers to advocate for policies that address poor and inconsistent policy implementation, scarcity of awareness about human trafficking, the lack of resources to help organizations in the delivery of services, interrelated systemic issues (e.g. gender inequality, unemployment, poverty, corruption, etc.) and the ever-changing facade of human trafficking. There should be a push for policies that focus less on the criminal justice perspective, and place more attention on victim-centered prevention, protection and prosecution. Importantly, the sociopolitical context of each country should be considered when advocating for a particular policy. The standards established by the Trafficking in Persons Report or the Palermo Protocol may not be relevant or appropriate for every policy. Placing a policy into the specific context of a country will yield better support from the government and the general public, and overall, better policy implementation.

References

Alvarez, M. B., & Alessi, E. J. (2012). Human Trafficking Is More Than Sex Trafficking and Prostitution: Implications for Social Work. *Affilia: Journal Of Women & Social Work, 27*(2), 142-152.

Baker, D., & Grover, A. (2013). Responding to Victims of Trafficking: Interagency Awareness, Housing Services, and Spiritual Care. *Social Work & Christianity*. 40(3). 308-321.

Barrick, K., Lattimore, P. K., Pitts, W. J., & Zhang, S. X. (2014). When farmworkers and advocates see trafficking but law enforcement does not: challenges in identifying labor trafficking in North Carolina. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, *61*(2), 205-214.

Bruch, E. A. (2004). Models wanted: The search for an effective response to human trafficking. *Stanford Journal of International Law, 40*(1), 1-45.

Busch-Armendariz, N., Nsonwu, M., & Hefforn, L. (2011). Human Trafficking Victims and their Children: Assessing Needs, Vulnerabilities, Strengths, and Survivorship. *Journal of Applied Research on Children*. *2*(1).

Caliber (2003). *Needs Assessment for Service Providers and Trafficking Victims.* Washington, D.C.: Clawson, H., Small, K., Go, E.

Caliber. (2007). Evaluation of comprehensive services for human trafficking: Key findings and lessons learned. Washington, D.C.: ICF International Company.

Cho, S., Dreher, A., & Neumayer, E. (2013). Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking?. *World Development, 41*67-4182.

Chuang, J. A. (2010). Rescuing trafficking from ideological capture: Prostitution reform and anti-trafficking law and policy. *University Of Pennsylvania Law Review*, *158*(6), 1655-1728.

Clawson, H. J., Dutch, N., Solomon, A., & Goldblatt, Grace, L. (2009). Human trafficking into and within the United States: A re-view of the literature. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation. Retrieved from: http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/07/humantrafficking/litrev/.

Clinton, H. R. (2009, June 17). Partnering Against Human Trafficking. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/06/16/AR2009061602628.html.

Davies, J. (2007). Helping sexual assault survivors with multiple victimizations and needs: A Guide for agencies serving sexual assault survivors. Retrieved from: http://www.nsvrc.org/sites/default/files/Helping-sexual-assault-survivors-with-multiple-victimizations-and-needs_0.pdf.

De Leon, F. (2010). Spanish legislation against trafficking in human beings: Punitive excess and poor victims assistance. *Crime, Law and Social Change, 54(5),* 381-409.

Dovydaitis, T. (2010). Human Trafficking: The Role of the Health Care Provider. *American College of Nurse-Midwives. 55*(5), 462-467.

Farrell, A. & Fahy, S. (2009). The problem of human trafficking in the U.S.: Public frames and policy responses. *Journal of Criminal Justice, 37*(6), 617-626.

Farrell, A., Owens, C., and McDevitt, J. (2014). New laws but few cases: understanding the challenges to the investigation and prosecution of human trafficking cases. *Crime, Law and Social Change, 61*(2), 139-168.

Farrell, A., & Pfeffer, R. (2014). Policing Human Trafficking Cultural Blinders and Organizational Barriers. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 653*(1), 46-64.

Feingold, D. A. (2005). Human Trafficking. *Foreign Policy,* (150). 26-32.

Freedom Network USA: To Empower Trafficked and Enslaved Persons (2012). *Human Trafficking and Domestic Violence*.

Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women. (2007). Collateral damage: The impact of anti-trafficking measures on human rights around the world. Bangkok, Thailand: Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women.

Gozdziak, E. M., & Collett, E. A. (2005). Research on Human Trafficking in North America: A Review of Literature. *International Migration, 43*(1/2), 99-128.

Heffernan, K., & Blythe, B. (2014). Evidence-Based Practice: Developing a Trauma-Informed Lens to Case Management for Victims of Human Trafficking. *Global Social Welfare.* 1, 169-177. *Human trafficking, case management, trauma-informed care*

Hernandez, D. & Rudolph, A. (2015). Modern day slavery: What drives human trafficking in Europe? *European Journal of Political Economy, 38*, 118-139.

Hodge, D. R. (2014). Assisting victims of human trafficking: Strategies to facilitate identification, exit from trafficking, and the restoration of wellness. *Social Work, 59*(2), 111-118.

Hyland, K. E. (2001). The impact of Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children. *Human Rights Brief, 8* (2). 1-4.

Iroanya, R. O. (2014). Human trafficking with specific reference to South African and

Mozambican counter-trafficking legislation. *Southern Africa Journal of Criminology, 27*(2), 102-115.

Jones, L., Engstrom, D. W., Hilliard, T., & Diaz, M. (2007). Globalization and Human Trafficking [article]. *Journal Of Sociology And Social Welfare*, *34*(2), 107-122.

Kangaspunta, K. (2003). Mapping the inhuman trade: Preliminary findings of the database on trafficking in human beings. *Forum on Crime and Society, 3*(1&2), 81-103.

Kaye, J., Winterdyk, J. & Quarterman, L. (2014). Beyond criminal justice: A case study of responding to human trafficking in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice, 56*(1), 23-48.

Keo, C., Bouhours, T., Broadhurst, R., & Bouhours, B. (2014). Human trafficking and moral panic in Cambodia. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 653*(1), 202-224.

President's I.T.F.T. (2015). *Federal Strategic Action Plan on Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in the United States 2013-2017.* Washington, D.C

Rand, A. M. (2015). "It's a marathon not a race": Exiting the commercial sex trade. National Institute of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, United States Department of Justice. Retrieved from: https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/248978.pdf

Sadruddin, H., Walter, N. and Hidalgo, J. (2005). Human trafficking in the United States: Expanding victim protection beyond prosecution witnesses. *Stanford Law & Policy Review, 16*(2), 379-416.

Sharapov, K. (2015). 'Traffickers and Their Victims': Anti-Trafficking Policy in the United Kingdom. *Critical Sociology*, 0896920515598562.

UN General Assembly. (2000). *Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*. Retrieved from http://www.uncjin.org/ Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_%20traff_eng.pdf.

U. S. Department of State (2010). Trafficking in Persons Report.

U. S. Department of State (2015). Trafficking in Persons Report.

Van Dijk, J., & Klerx-Van Mierlo, F. (2014). Quantitative indices for anti-human trafficking policies based on reports of the US State Department and the Council of Europe. *Crime, Law and Social Change, 61*(2), 229-250.

Van Impe, K. (2000). People for Sale: The Need for a Multidisciplinary Approach towards Human Trafficking. *International Migration*, *38*(3), 113-131.

Verhoeven, M., & van Gestel, B. (2011). Human trafficking and criminal investigation strategies in the Amsterdam Red Light District. *Trends in Organized Crime, 14*(2-3), 148-164.

Visayan Forum Foundation. (2015, July 2). CCTV Asia features VF in a documentary on Cybersex. Retrieved from: http://www.visayanforum.org/wp/cctv-asia-features-vf-in-a-documentary-on-cybersex/.

Weitzer, R. (2014). New directions in research on human trafficking. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, *653*(1), 6-24.

Williamson, E., Dutch, N. & Clawson, H. (2010). Evidence-Based Mental Health Treatment for Victims of Trafficking. S. Department of Health and Human Services, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, Washington, D.C.

Wisconsin Office of Justice Assistance. (2012). Wisconsin Human Trafficking Protocol and Resource Manual. Wisconsin Office of Justice Assistant's Violence Against Women Program. Retrieved from: http://www.endabusewi.org/sites/default/files/resources/wisconsin_human_trafficking_protocol_and_resource_manual.pdf.

Zhang, S. (2012). Measuring labor trafficking: a research note. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, *58*(4), 469-482.

Zillah, A. (2011). Best practices to combat human trafficking. Washington State Department of Commerce Research Services. Retrieved from: http://www.commerce.wa.

This research was commissioned by Safe Horizon, Inc., developed and written under the direction of Dr. Judy L. Postmus at the Center on Violence Against Women and Children, Rutgers University School of Social Work. This brief focuses on practices adopted by service providers in their work with survivors of trafficking. This material is based upon work supported by Philip Morris International. Any opinions and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the official opinion of Safe Horizon, Inc. or Philip Morris International.